EXHIBIT 52

CASE 0:16-cv-01054-DTS Doc. 1146-51 Filed 03/05/23 Page 2 of 8

From:

CN=Lance Martin/O=ChubbMail

Sent:

Wednesday, November 25, 2015 1:23 PM

To:

CN=Ramesh Pandey/O=ChubbMail@ChubbMail

Subject:

Fw: Duff & Phelps template - summary of updates made to date

Attach:

ACE Chubb Valuation November 2015.xlsx; EmbeddedImage0001.gif;

EmbeddedImage0002.gif

FYI - meant to copy you on the original. We are scheduled to meet to review this on Monday @ 11.

Happy Thanksgiving!

Lance Martin • Chubb Group of Insurance Companies • www.Chubb.com • 15 Mountain View Road, Warren, NJ 07059

• Phone: (908) 903-2209 • Email: lancemartin@chubb.com

---- Forwarded by Lance Martin/ChubbMail on 11/25/2015 02:16 PM -----

From: Lance Martin/ChubbMail

To: Robert A Iskols/ChubbMail@ChubbExchange Cc: Cullen C Mccarthy/ChubbMail@ChubbMail

Date: 11/25/2015 10:07 AM

Subject: Duff & Phelps template - summary of updates made to date

Rob -

I wanted to share the responses we've collected to date on the Duff & Phelps valuation (see attached).

In terms of their original questions, where we are at is as follows (we are reviewing EA provided responses with Ramesh Monday):

#1 - Complete (provided 11/13)

#2 - Complete

#3 & #8 - CCI, CSI and CAZ responses complete. Responses pending from BPS leads for CPI (expected today) and Claims (expected Tuesday)

#4 & #5 - Your team to provide

#6 - You have responses available based on a review done with BC

#7 - Your team (Fazal) to provide

#9 - Complete





Thanks,	

Lance Martin • Chubb Group of Insurance Companies • www.Chubb.com • 15 Mountain View Road, Warren, NJ 07059 • Phone: (908) 903-2209 • Email: lancemartin@chubb.com

DOCUMENT PRODUCED AS NATIVE

Confidential - Attorneys' Eyes Only

The Chubb Corporation Business Application Inventory and Assessment

					VALUATION QUESTIONS* Please note that any dollar							
REFERENCE #		Product Name	Description of Use	Business Segment	CONTRIBUTION (Increased Revenue Growth, Increased Customer Retention, Cost Savings, Efficiency Gains, Compliance, Analytic, Business Maintenance)	STRENGTHS - Compared to technology used by competitors	WEAKNESSES - Compared to technology used by competitors	HISTORICAL COSTS Capitalized/expensed for Development/Enhancement Since Inception	ESTIMATE OF Current cost to purchase or develop	% OBSOLETE (relative to full functionality)	REMAINING USEFU LIFE (Months)	JL SUNSET STRATEGY (from ACE & Deloitte)
1	Business Intelligence	Example ABC	Description of Application ABC	Commercial Large Accour P&C	nt Reporting, Compliance, Cost Savings, Efficiency	Strong - this capability was developed in house and provides broader technology than what is available in the market.		n/a	\$1,000,000	0%	60	No plans to early retire
2	Policy Management	Example XYZ	Description of Application XYZ	Commercial Large Accour P&C	nt Business maintenance		WEAKNESSES - difficult to add new lines, green screen, outdated capabilities and technology.	\$1,000,000	\$7,000,000		12	Plan to retire in 2016
3	Policy Management	Masterpiece		СРІ							36	Replace (Target of 3 - 5 years)
4	Policy Management	GPE	Chubb's flagship Policy Administration system developed in-house. It is a Smalltalk desktop application with an IMS/DB2 backend that is delivered over Citrix to Agents/brokers for processing quote, bind and issue, majority of New Lines and Endorsements transactions. High level lines of business processed include: Home, Auto, Valuables Articles, and Excess Home and Auto. Used by the Chubb CSRs, underwriters, and agents in the US. Custom developed Group Personal Excess system that was developed as a quick way to help automate the process of enrolling participants into a Group Excess Policy to reduce manual processing in order process higher volumes of policies. The system is exposed to Agents and group participants through a web browser interface. It supports bulk enrollment via a spreadsheet upload process of participants or enrollment on an	CPI		to submit new business and support existing Group Excess business. • Provides the ability for participants to self enroll through a web browser interface. • Provides an easy way for participants to understand and select coverages and limits. • Provides automatic generation of Certificates of	Difficult to find resources to support Smalltalk Embedded rules are difficult to update and maintain Duplicated product rules in Print which makes maintenance and enhancements more difficult. Smalltalk desktop application difficult to expose to end users over the web, requires Citrix client. Coding based configuration not true external configuration based, making it harder to enhance. Does not support automated booking at the group or participant policy level (on priority list). Only supports Agency billing at the group policy level (on priority list). Does not support direct bill at the participant policy level (on priority list). Online credit card payment at the time of self- enrollment (on priority list). No backend Policy Administration system with full rating capability.				48	Survive
			individual basis.			Ability for Under Writing to configure Premium and Under Writing questions that are executed during the participant enrollment process. Ability to assign Underwriters and manage incoming work using Salesforce. Account details are stored, managed and accessed within the Salesforce platform by Underwriting, Operations, and Marketing.						
5	Policy Management / CRM	Client	PM THE SECOND STATE OF THE SECOND SEC	СРІ							60	Survive
			The Client system leverages Informatica MDM to capture and manage business parties (insureds, drivers and mortagees) and household information taking in feeds from Masterpiece, CAAS and Yacht. Business Party information flows to the MDM in both batch and near real-time requests. In addition to the MDM there is a Browser based user interface that is used by both internal staff and Agents to deliver a household member view, policy portfolio view and Total Insured Value (TIV) of the household.			System driven, rules based process for building a household that includes household members, policies and Total Insured Value (TIV) view of a household. Single golden record for individuals (insureds, drivers, mortgagees). Key resource for Underwriters to make risk and pricing decisions when evaluating policies against a household's exposure history across mutiple products and policy systems.	Requires ongoing monitoring to support the expected growth which could require hardware upgrades and increased license costs. Requires active data steward monitoring and intervention to maintain the integrity and quality of MDM data.					
6	Underwriting	Customarq	The Commercial Lines Package system is a multi- product rating, calc, booking and print system. The system supports Products including Customarq Classic, Customarq Limited, Customarq Essential, EIIC and QCC, and Marketing Programs such as Lau firms, Health and Life Sciences, Broadcasters, Telecommunications, Wineries, Museums, Art Galleries, Restaurants, Funeral Homes, Nursing Homes, Continuum, and others. Various departments including DFI, CCI, TIS, ERS and other may underwrite the business processed in the system. The system supports domestic as well as international locations and coverages.	V	The Customarq system supports approximately 40k policies with a Written premium of \$1.78. It is the cornerstone product for Chubb Commercial insureds. The CCI and CSI total written premium for insureds who have a CMQ policy total \$3.78. there is not a hugely significant growth of new business coming onto the platform. CCI is working on increasing New Business growth by creating an ISO like product and will focus on the the smaller end of the Middle Market. It will be implemented on Duck Creek, not Customarq. No cost savings anticipated until re written in Duck Creek.	Strengths: Custom multi line PAS supporting commercial mono-line and package policies, uses commercially available rating engine; supports high transaction volumes, very stable platform, large book of business.	Weakness: Large effort to add new products, green screen, outdated technologies			40% obsolete - based on the fact that the system is complex and slow to make necessan product and functional changes		Replace (Target of 3 - 5 years)

The Chubb Corporation

Business	Application	Inventory	and	Assessmen

					VALUATION QUESTIONS* Please note that any dollar figures below are based on quickly derived information								
REFERENCE #	: Category	Product Name	Description of Use	Business Segment	CONTRIBUTION (Increased Revenue Growth, Increased Customer Retention, Cost Savings, Efficiency Gains, Compliance, Analytic, Business Maintenance)	STRENGTHS - Compared to technology used by competitors	WEAKNESSES - Compared to technology used by competitors	HISTORICAL COSTS Capitalized/expensed for Development/Enhancement Since Inception	ESTIMATE OF Current cost to purchase or develop	% OBSOLETE (relative to full functionality)	LIFE (Months)	Deloitte)	•
7	Underwriting	CUW	The Commercial Underwriting Workstation provides an electronic environment to support and enhance the commercial underwriting business process. It provides quick access to key customer relationships, underwriting documentation, service and producer information needed to service customers. There are also additional work management tools to support a variety of functions including a personal suspense log. There are over 6,000 users in US and Canada from CCI, CSI, CPI (i.e. Signature Solutions), ABL, Marketing and OSD.	CCI		- Flexible intuitive User Interface - High Performance and highly stable - Functionality extends across multiple lines of busines	Difficult to find resources to support Smalltalk Uses some old unsupported frameworks Uses legacy point-to-point services s			20% obsolete - based on the fact that the systems are written in a technologies that need to be upgraded Entry for CUW & Client/WIP			Survive
8	Policy Management / CRM	Client/WIP	This system manages client, submission, prospect and high level policy information across all commercial lines of business (CCI, CSI & Direct Bill). It was designed to provide accessible, comprehensive information about Chubbs commercial clients so that client activities can be better coordinated and more informed business decisions can be made.	ССІ	tracking, and document filing. • Supports management at the account, Policy, and Transaction level as well as the Book level. Cost savings in terms of FTE are expected as the NewCo begins to leverage routing of work to the most efficient place, but this is difficult to quantify. Entry for CUW & Client/WIP combined into 1 since CUW can't operate without Client/WIP		- Difficult to find resources to support the legacy IMS DB/DC and Telon technologies the applications are built with.			combined into 1 since CUW can't operate without Client/WIP	60		Survive
9	Risk Management	ELIAS	This application is a risk assessment tool for OSUS and US locations. This application is used in the US, European, Asia Pacific (Austrailia) and Candian Zones. The application provides online geocoding of addresses, and creates a snapshot report with all the location information, which includes CRESTA, Chubb Insureds at that address with all the details and aggregations. Snapshot includes building names, address, MMI, Distance from coast, control zone, flood zone, number of Chubb personal and commercial occupants, etc.). It can also produce adjacent reports using spatial analysis and customer lists for a given boundary.	CCI, CPI	ELIAS is a modern based application joining policy location data with GIS (mapping technology) to give a geographic view of our book of business. Multiple policy issuance systems supply ELIAS with location, coverage and peril data. Location data is geocoded to a map point from which hazard risks can be derived as well as exposure aggregation. It is used heavily in the underwriting of property exposures, as well as provides input to the CAT modeling activity. It's contribution to CCI's results is through the quality of data used during the underwriting and pricing of property exposures. In just the Customarq view - that's close to \$922M of written premium.	aggregations , • provides batch and online geocoding • provides 38 services - both web and MQ - to many of the PAS, used during rating • single site analysis with map visualizations • exposures, perils and hazards for a given location • portfolio analysis	difficult to find resources proficient in GIS technologies load of vendor hazard data is time-consuming			10% obsolete - based on the fact that not all chubb systems worldwide support the feeding of exposures for aggregation.	48	Replace (Target of 3 years)
10	Policy Management	Work Comp	This is a policy administration system that processes Workers Compensation policies. Line of Business Supported: Workers Comp. Product Supported: Workers Comp. Location Of Business Users: CSRs at Chubb Processing Centers, Home Office (Product Analyst, BOS, Help Desk) and Chubb Underwriting Centers. Geographic Areas: USA.	ссі	The Work Comp system supports approximately 30k policies with a Written premium of \$1.18. Over the last year, there has been a growth of new business in the range of 15%. CCI is working on increasing New Business growth by offering the Work Comp coverages through ar online portal (in addition to other lines) focused on the smaller end of the Middle Market. This will not be implemented on the Chubb Work Comp system - it cannot handle that kind of interaction.	capabilities such as custom Pricing Tools, as compared s to commercially available products. Supports very n large policies. Meets Business needs, componentized	Weakness: Outdated technologies (smalltalk etc), rigid data model may require investment to keep up with increasing complexity of the Line of Business/regulations and business needs			25% obsolete - based on the fact that the system is old, complex and written in a technology that needs to be upgraded	36	Suns	et (Q1 2017)
11	Policy Management / Underwriting	CSI Express	CSI eXPRESS is the Policy Administration system for Chubb's Specialty Lines developed in-house. It is a .NET desktop application with an Informix backend that is delivered Underwriters for processing quote, bind and issue. It handles all active CSI products (total of 113), processes New Lines and renewals, and Endorsements transactions. The Ratings functionality is being backed by the CSI Ratings application - online Java Websphere application with the Duck Creek Rating engine	CSI	The Court of the C		- this is a fat client application g			0% obsolete - performing at full functionality, with limited deficiencies as it relates to business capabilities. While there are enhancements in the queue for improvements, there aren't major gaps in functionality that the business is expecting.	36	Suns	et (Q3 2017)

					VALUATION QUESTIONS* Please note that any dollar figures below are based on quickly derived information							
REFERENCE #	Category	Product Name	Description of Use	Business Segment	CONTRIBUTION (Increased Revenue Growth, Increased Customer Retention, Cost Savings, Efficiency Gains, Compliance, Analytic, Business Maintenance)	STRENGTHS - Compared to technology used by competitors	WEAKNESSES - Compared to technology used by competitors	HISTORICAL COSTS Capitalized/expensed for Development/Enhancement Since Inception	ESTIMATE OF Current cost to purchase or develop	% OBSOLETE (relative to full functionality)	REMAINING USEFUL LIFE (Months)	SUNSET STRATEGY (from ACE Deloitte)
12	Policy Management	Decision Point	Decision Point is a market facing web quote solution which can be accessed directly from @chubb targeting primarily agent useSolution supports on-line new business submission creation and quote generation for the selected Specialty lines of business (D&O, EPL, Crime and Fiduciary) User interface is a WebSphere application running in the Extranet environment - Decision Point provides external user interface to CSIX processing within business limits - Decision Point supports Internal eApplication upload as well as eMail upload and round trip capabilities - It supports an AMS Integration – Vertafore provides a direct upload from the system to Decision Point.	CSI	The target new business goal is \$6M, with an \$8M target in 2016. CSI's new business through DecisionPoint last year was \$4.3M. For 2015, this represents approximately 15% of the new business total (a combination of new business through DecisionPoint and via traditional methods) for these lines of coverage. We currently due not perform an actuarial profitability study on DecisionPoint business, but based on size and coverage offered, we assume an 88% combined ratio and a 90% retention rate. This is based on studies of business with similar size and coverage characteristics.	Support of competitors applications Speed of generating new quotes Support of an AMS integration Use of Blaze Decision services to determine Eligibility,	Integration with CSI eXPRESS system is incomplete. Supports very limited number of CSI products Pricing component does not use the CSI Duck Creek engine			25% obsolete - the expectation of DecisionPoint is to Obtain a bindable quote for qualified business. At this point, the system offers this capability and therefore meets the business expectation. However, since Straight Through Processing is currently not available, I would say that the business utility is 75%.		Sunset (Q3 2017)
13	Claim Management	ClaimVision	Claim Management system that includes a workstation, financial and authority components (among others)	Claims		Custom claim workstation optimized for Chubb workflow and processes. Configurable and updateable to support changing workflow and processes. Entirely web based for easy deployment	HTML front end is based on older technology Has several key mainframe based background processes Opportunities exist to automate additional workflows.				60	Replace (Target of 3 years)
14	Claim Management	Predictive Modeling	A process for transforming data into an estimation of future claim outcomes upon which actionable decisions can be made. Models produce an advisory of 1 to 100 that indicates ultimate claim severity as well as reason messages that describe the factors driving that severity. Claim management uses the model output to optimize the assignment of resources to each claim, allowing us to achieve the most appropriate settlements.	Claims		Custom predicitve models allows for workflow optimization, expense reduction and superior claim outcomes	Some models are in .Net and some in SAS. Models can run near real time (5-10 minutes), but not real time as currently implemented				48	Sunset (Q4 2017)
15	Claim Management	Iris	First Notice of Loss Entry System for Service Centers and Chubb Svcs.	Claims	•	Optimized for efficient use of callers time on phone. Does not require CSR to have insurance technical knowledge such as coverages.	Not as optimal for entering claims from emails or forms HTML front end is based on older technology				60	Survive
16	Claim Management	eLoss	Loss Reporting forms on Chubb.com, automatic feed to CV database, including extranet access for electronically receiving FNOLs via IVANs Transformation Station from Applied Agency Management system.	Claims		Simple to use, modern interface. Policy information prefilled and available for registered insureds and agents	Chubb CSR needs to walk claim through IRIS for quality check. Insured not given examiner name - eLoss does not perform automated examiner assignment				60	Survive
17.	Claim Management	CIS Claims (ER/CIS)	ERCIS (Executive Risk Claims Information System). Claim System for Specialty LOB for the policies issued out of CSI eXPRESS Policy System It supports the following business capabilities (high level): - Claims management - Financials - Administartive tasks - Downstream	Claims		- tightly integrated with CSI eXPRESS -very stable, low maintenance - user friendly interface - meets all business' needs	- tightly integrated with CSI eXPRESS - introduces an extra Claims platform for the enterprise - need for a unique expertize to maintain the app - need for extra feeds and integrations with the corporate systems				36	Sunset (Q3 2016)
18	Financial Management	GFS/Peoplesoft	Suite of Peoplesoft modules covering Accounts Receivable, Accounts Payable, Asset Management, Expense Allocations, General Ledger and Bank Reconcilliation (among others). Some Chubb specific customization included.	Finance		Globally integrated, Many useful customizations to modules, particularly in AP, Robust Change Management. Highly Detailed expense allocation. Current version(9.2). Workflow for approvals implemented in multiple modules. Robust T&E integration with MyWallet. Streamlined single ledger design implementing book code functionality lowers reporting and maintenance effort.	Does not support Statutory Reporting				48	Sunset (Q2 2017)

The Chubb Corporation Business Application Inventory and Assessment

					VALUATION QUESTIONS* Please note that any dollar f	igures below are based on quickly derived information						
FEDERICE #	Category	Product Name	Description of Use	Business Segment	CONTRIBUTION (Increased Revenue Growth, Increased Customer Retention, Cost Savings, Efficiency Gains, Compliance, Analytic, Business Maintenance)	STRENGTHS - Compared to technology used by competitors	WEAKNESSES - Compared to technology used by competitors	HISTORICAL COSTS Capitalized/expensed for Development/Enhancement Since Inception	ESTIMATE OF Current cost to purchase or develop	% OBSOLETE (relative to full functionality)	REMAINING USEFUL S	UNSET STRATEGY (from a
19	Portal	Extranet (@Chubb, CPIASP,	Description of ose	CPI	Analytic, business Maintenance)	Target architecture is based on open standards and	competitors	псериоп	or develop	to full functionality)	60	Survive
13	1 Ortal	CPICSP)				service oriented architecture (SOA).	Currently in the process of rearchitecting the platform				50	341110
			CPI CSP is a standards based Java/HTML5 portal			A Astirah was diku A	away from the old IBM Jade framework to a more modern standards based service oriented architecture.					
			for Personal Lines Customers that provides the			Actively used by Agents to manage their Personal lines book of business.	modern standards based service oriented architecture.					
			ability to view Masterpiece Policies, view policy			ines book of business.	Web Analytics software (IBM Netinsight) will be out of					
			documents, pay bills, submit and view claims and			Integrated with Masterpiece, Billing and Claim	support in 3rd quarter of 2017. Target is Google					
			view appraisal information.			systems.	Analytics.					
			CPI ASP is standards based Java/HTML5 portal for			Suports self service for retrieving policy documents in						
			Personal Lines Agents that provides the ability to			PDF format.	new target architecture will support any third party					
			view Masterpiece Policies, view policy documents, pay bills, submit and view claims and view			Based on a standard based UX framework that	Web Content Management system.					
			appraisal information. Access is appropriately			supports responsive design and a modern look and feel.						
			limited as to what agent has authority to view. A			supporter responsive design and a modern rook and reen						
			key component for agents is the My Alerts			Target architecture will support a user configurable						
			component that notifies agents to events that are			advanced notification system that integrates email and						
			happening to their book of business.			text alerts with backend billing, claims and policy						
			Dantal and the same and the sam			systems.						
			Portal security is controlled through security roles in a third party product called GetAccess from									
			Entrust. Integration with backend systems is									
			accomplished through Web REST and SOAP									
			services.									
20	Business Intelligence	Data Lake	An enterprise data hub that supports structured	N/A		> Provides a scalable Enterprise Analytics platform for	> Support engineers are well sought and hence difficult				24	Sunset (Q4 2016
			and unstructured data which lays a strong				to hire and retain > Expansion					
			foundation for analytics and meets management				of capacity is slower as compared to cloud					
			and financial reporting and business needs. Initial data sources loaded into Data Lake include EPIC,			integration. Supports column level integration. > Low cost per TB of data as compared to Netezza or	implmentation					
			Client and WIP. Primary users include Data Science,			Cloud Hadoop implementations > In						
			Computational Data Analyst, Actuarary and other			house implementation allows flexibility in configuring a						
			teams for discovery of analytics, use cases, BI and			toolset of choice > Allows for better						
			reporting.			integration with other enterprise applications (on						
						premise)						
21	Policy Management	Evolution	Evolution is a new policy administration system	Personal Lines	Contribution to growth = \$7.2M (2.4% on \$300M GWP).	Configurable PAS, designed for both Personal and	Limited resource capacitity for major additional system			25% obsolete -	36	Survive
			that facilitates low, medium and high touch		Cost savings = \$6M annual (2% on \$300M GWP). Cost	Commercial products.	adoption (new product development & testing).			modernization of the		
			business, it is a platform that will be used for all		savings based on an estimated savings of approximately		Blend of DotNet (UI) and Java (services).			Powerbuilder code into		
			lines of business. Evolution supports the entire		2% on expense ratio due to the automation the system					SOA components that		
			policy life cycle, and is designed for internal and external users, with Internationalization support.		provides (82% of 85,000 Renewals are 0-Touch - automatically renewed by the system)	Fully configurable User Interface, with reusable product configurations.				needs to be completed in the next 2 years		
			We are taking a phased approach to build all		automatically renewed by the system,	comparations.				in the next 2 years		
			functionalities, the whole application construction									
			will take multiple years. Evolution includes some									
			major components/applications such as ePolicy									
			Chubbfolio (online document delivery), Work									
			Manager, etc. Evolution is due to be finished building out by end of 2017 (shutting down									
			Renaissance).									
22	Policy Manager	Infinet		Accident & Health		Complete A&H PAS, extensible to brokers via Infinite	IIS only				36	TBD
22	Policy Management	millet	Web Based Extranet Policy Administration system that handles the full life-cycle (Submissions, Rating,	Accident & Flearth		Exchange.	C3 only				50	IDU
			Booking and Issuing Policies) for Accident & Health			Current technology (Java/Web UI).						
			products.									
23	Policy Management /	EZER	Underwriting workstation and policy	CCI		Single platform for all EUZ Commecial policy	Outdated technologies (PowerBuilder desktop client)				36	Sunset (Q4 2017)
	Underwriting		administration application that supports complete			management.	No rating function - calculated externally via Excel					
			end to end policy life-cycle for all CCI and CSI			Validation services all for external quoting (via Broker or						
			business in EUZ.			other sites).	entry and use					
24	Policy Management	LAZUW	Policy issuance and administration system	CPI		Meets Business needs	Java desktop client with very custom frameworks.				60	Sunset (Q4 2017)
			(integrated with I-Broker or stand alone)			Reuse of "iBroker" for rating	"Configuration" is code-dependant.					
25	Financial Management	PRISM	supporting personal and commercial lines. AS/400 cobol based General Insurance packaged	Finance		Complete system for Policy, Claims, Financials.	UNSUPPORTED customization of a vendor package -				48	Sunset (Q4 2017)
23	i manciai ivianagement	1 MOIN	application from CSC (Polisy/400), providing core	rinance		Front-Ends and integration services developed to	significant change from original code base				70	Juliset (Q4 2017)
			business functions such as Quote, Book, Issue,			leverage additional systems/plaforms.	(COBOL/400).					
			Claims, etc. PRISM feeds APZ premium and loss			3.	Limited configurability					
			transactions to financial and other corporate				Use for any single function requires data for ALL					
			systems.				functions (Claims must have policy, etc)					
							Web UI and data integrations require custom					
							development.					